

1 Damion D. D. Robinson, State Bar No. 262573
DIAMOND McCARTHY LLP
2 355 South Grand Avenue, Suite 2450
Los Angeles, California 90071
3 Tel. (424) 278-2335
Fax (424) 278-2339
4 damion.robinson@diamondmccarthy.com

FILED
Superior Court of California
County of Los Angeles
06/14/2024

David W. Slayton, Executive Officer / Clerk of Court
By: M. Fregoso Deputy

5 Attorneys for Plaintiffs Xin Chen and Brian Chiang
and the Class and Subclasses
6

7
8 **SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**
9 **COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES**

10 XIN CHEN, an individual; and BRIAN
11 CHIANG, an individual; individually and on
behalf of all others similarly situated;

12 Plaintiffs,

13 vs.

14 GHP MANAGEMENT CORPORATION, a
15 California corporation, *et al.*

16 Defendants.

Case No.: BC 713402

(Consolidated Case No. 19 STCV 03883)

Assigned for All Purposes to:
The Hon. Elihu M. Berle, Dept. 6

[PROPOSED] JUDGMENT

Date: May 29, 2024

Time: 9:00 a.m.

Dept.: 6 (Spring Street)

Action Filed: July 13, 2018

Trial Date: None Set

17
18
19 The Court, having granted final approval of the parties' Class Action Settlement Agreement
20 (the "Agreement"), hereby enters judgment pursuant to that Agreement as follows.

21 **IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED:**

22 **A. Definitions**

23 The "Settlement Class" is defined as follows:

24 All former tenants of Defendants who moved out of apartment
25 buildings or complexes owned or managed by Defendants, or any of
26 them, during the Class Period from whom Defendants withheld more
than \$125.00 of their security deposits other than for Unpaid Rent
and Utilities (as defined in the Agreement).

27 The Settlement Class excludes the following: Any persons who were evicted; Any persons
28 who have previously settled their claims with Defendants; The Court and its staff; Defendants

1 and their affiliates; any person employed by any Defendant during the Class Period; and minors
2 and other persons not party to a lease with Defendants. Putative Class member Jessica Litsheim
3 who timely filed a proper request for exclusion from the Settlement Class is hereby excluded
4 from the definition of Settlement Class.

5 **“Defendants”** is defined as follows: Defendants, Cross-Complainants and related parties
6 GHP Management Corporation; G.H. Palmer Associates; LR 9th and Broadway, LLC; 918
7 Broadway Associates, LLC; CCV Partnership II, a California Limited Partnership; Saugus Colony
8 Limited, a California Limited Partnership; Palmer Temple Street Properties, LLC; Palmer Temple
9 Street Properties, L.P.; Canyon Sierra Apartments; Canyon Sierra Properties, LLC; Palmer Flower
10 Street Properties, a California Limited Partnership; Palmer Flower Street Properties II, L.P.; Palmer
11 Flower Street Properties II, LLC; Palmer/City Center II, Inc.; Palmer/City Center II, a California
12 Limited Partnership; Palmer Boston Street Properties I, LP; Palmer Boston Street Properties II, LP;
13 Palmer Boston Street Properties II, Inc.; Palmer Boston Street Properties III, a California Limited
14 Partnership; Orsini III, LLC; Bridewell Properties, Ltd., a California Limited Partnership; Park
15 Sierra Properties, a California Limited Partnership; Park Sierra Apartments, LLC; 4914 Olive Street
16 Properties, LLC; Palmer Ontario Properties, LP; Piero Properties II, LLC; Palmer St. Paul
17 Properties, LP; Palmer/Sixth Street Properties, L.P.; Park Sierra Properties II, a California Limited
18 Partnership; Park Sierra Properties II, Inc.; The Solemint Heights Partnership, a California Limited
19 Partnership; Palmer-Saugus, a California Limited Partnership; Palmer Sand Canyon, Ltd., a
20 California Limited Partnership; Figter Limited, a California Limited Partnership; Warner Center
21 Summit Ltd., a California Limited Partnership; Westcreek Properties Ltd., a California Limited
22 Partnership; Upland Village Green, a California Limited Partnership; Upland Village Green, LLC;
23 Easton Investments II, a California Limited Partnership; Palmer/Third Street Properties, L.P., a
24 California Limited Partnership; and Visconti Apartments, LLC.

25 The **“Defendant Released Parties”** are defined as follows: Defendants, including, without
26 limitation, currently and previously named defendants in the Action, and each of their past and
27 present officers, trustees, beneficiaries, directors, shareholders, owners, subsidiaries, parent
28 companies, sister companies, affiliates, alter egos, joint ventures, partners, partnerships, members,

1 limited liability companies, companies, divisions, representatives, employees, agents, attorneys,
2 insurers, vendors, third party managers, predecessors, successors and assigns.

3 **“GHP Property”** is defined as follows: any apartment building at any of the following
4 communities: (1) The Paseos at Montclair North, (2) Pasadena Park Place Apartments, (3) Diamond
5 Park Apartments, (4) Canyon Country Villas, (5) The Village, (6) Skyline Terrance, (7) Broadway
6 Palace Apartments, (8) The Orsini, (9) The Medici, (10) The Lorenzo, (11) Sand Canyon Villas &
7 Townhomes, (12) The Piero, (13) The Da Vinci, (14) Sand Canyon Ranch, (15) River Ranch
8 Townhomes & Apartments, (16) Park Sierra, (17) Colony Townhomes, (18) River Park Apartments,
9 (19) Upland Village Green Apartments, (20) The Visconti, (21) The Summit at Warner Center, (22)
10 The Terrance Apartments, (23) The Paseos at Ontario, and (24) Sea View Villas. **“GHP Properties”**
11 means all of the above-referenced buildings and communities.

12 **B. Compliance with Agreement**

13 After the expiration of any deadlines to seek reconsideration of this Judgement or the Court’s
14 Order granting final approval of the Settlement, and the exhaustion of any appeals, the parties, the
15 class action administrator, and the escrow agent, shall administer the settlement in compliance with
16 the terms of the Agreement. It is noted that having been no objectors, no one has standing to
17 challenge the final order as entered.

18 **C. Releases**

19 Upon the making of the First Settlement Payment as provided in the Agreement, each
20 member of the Settlement Class is adjudged to have released each of the Defendant Released Parties
21 from all actions, claims, demands, rights, suits, and causes of action alleged in the First Amended
22 Complaint in Case No. BC713402 and the consolidated Complaint in Case No. 19STCV03833 as
23 provided in the Agreement and Addendum No. 1 thereto. The release includes only those claims and
24 causes of action accruing during the Class Period. This release does **not** include claims for personal
25 injury or wrongful death.

26 Each of the Defendant Released Parties is adjudged to have released, effective as of the date
27 of the making of the First Settlement Payment, each member of the Settlement Class from any and
28 all actions, claims, demands, rights, suits, and causes of action of the Defendant Released Parties, of

1 whatever kind, whether known or unknown, against the members of the Settlement Class, for
2 physical damages (including, without limitation, assessed charges for apartment cleaning, painting,
3 carpet cleaning and/or carpet replacement), fees and/or other amounts that Defendants contend are
4 owed under the lease agreements entered into by members of the Settlement Class at a GHP Property
5 during period of July 13, 2014 through June 30, 2022, excluding claims by Defendants for Unpaid
6 Rent and Utilities, as defined in the Agreement.

7 **D. Forward Looking Relief**

8 Defendants shall take all reasonable steps to ensure that all residential communities in the
9 State of California owned or managed by Defendants are in compliance with California Civil Code
10 section 1950.5.

11 Defendants shall:

12 (i) provide departing tenants who are charged \$125 or more for cleaning or repairs done by
13 third party vendors with receipts or invoices from the party doing the work, either within 21 days of
14 the end of the tenancy, or within 14 days of receipt of the documentation from the third party,
15 whichever is later. If Defendants do not have documentation available from the third-party vendor
16 within the 21-day period after the end of the tenancy, they shall also provide the tenant a reasonable
17 estimate of the costs.

18 (ii) to the extent that Defendants deduct from security deposits for in-house labor or
19 materials, Defendants shall (a) reasonably describe the work performed by in-house personnel and
20 provide the hours and hourly rate charged; and (b) provide a bill, invoice, receipt, price list, or
21 similar documentation of each charge for in-house supplies charged against a tenant deposit.

22 If any provision of Civil Code section 1950.5 or any other applicable statute is changed,
23 clarified or otherwise modified through statute, regulation or case law, GHP shall comply with the
24 applicable provision as changed, clarified or otherwise modified.

25 **E. Settlement Approval Order**

26 The Court further enters judgment on its Order Granting Final Approval of Class Action
27 Settlement of even date therewith, which is incorporated herein by reference. Pursuant to the terms
28 of the Agreement, the gross settlement payment to the class is \$10,000,000 in cash and an estimated

1 \$2,500,000 in waiver of alleged liabilities owed by the class to the Defendants. Said funds shall be
2 disbursed as provided in the Agreement.

3 **F. Modification**

4 This judgment will be reopened and modified to reflect any cy pres distribution of settlement
5 funds as provided in the Agreement.

6
7 Dated: 06/14/2024



Elihu M. Berle
The Honorable Elihu M. Berle
JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT
Elihu M. Berle / Judge

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

PROOF OF SERVICE

I am employed in the County of Los Angeles, State of California. I am over the age of 18 and not a party to the within action; my business address is: 355 South Grand Avenue, Suite 2450, Los Angeles, CA 90071.

On June 10, 2024, I served the following document:

[PROPOSED] JUDGMENT

on interested parties in this action by electronic service as described below.

Counsel for Defendants GHP Management Corporation, et al.
Robert M. Waxman
Jason L. Haas
Ervin Cohen & Jessup LLP
9401 Wilshire Blvd., Ninth Floor
Beverly Hills, CA 90212-2974
Tel. (310) 273-6333
rwaxman@ecjlaw.com;
jhaas@ecjlaw.com;

Counsel for Defendants GHP Management Corporation, et al.
Robert A. Latham III
Frances O’Meara
Wood, Smith, Henning & Berman LLP
10960 Wilshire Blvd., 18th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90024
rlatham@wshblaw.com;
fomeara@wshblaw.com

Counsel for Plaintiff Kierney Waldron
Jimmie Davis Parker, SBN 252023
Law Office of Jimmie Davis Parker
4241 Arden Way
San Diego, CA 92103
Tel. (619) 887-3300
JDParker@gmail.com

Richard Scott Lysle
Law Office of Richard Scott Lysle
475 Washington Blvd., Suite 200
Marina del Rey, CA 90292
Tel. (310) 822-6023
Lyslelaw@yahoo.com

BY ELECTRONIC SERVICE: Pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure § 1010.6 and the Court’s Order directing service via CaseAnywhere, I caused the documents to be sent to the persons at the notification addresses listed above using the CaseAnywhere electronic service platform.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the above is true and correct. Executed on June 10, 2024

M.J. Medina